



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Physical Review & Research International |
| Manuscript Number: | 2012_PRRI_2945 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Study of Compactons and Solitons using Finite Element Method |

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

Salam

We would like to thank the anonymous referee for suggestion.

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|--|
| <u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments | The scope of the manuscript might be of interest and as far as I know, studies of compactons and solitons using FEM are rare. However, the paper does not include any details whatsoever concerning the FEM solution procedure and therefore it is impossible to judge the quality of the paper and the included results. My suggestion is therefore that the authors rewrite the paper in a much more detailed manner including an introduction with a good background to the necessity of the paper. Then, but only then, it would be possible to make a proper review of the paper. | As you said, FEM analysis for compactons and solitons are rare, this method is more useful for example for macro wave lamp designing (acting to solve Maxwell equations by special sharp boundaries) and mechanics engineering too. Following your suggestion, we introduce FEM for two general (but simple!) problems, one for time independent and the other for time dependent (including time domain) cases. Details of calculations was not inserted for short writing. Some major revisions applied to manuscript following your suggestion. Best regards |
| <u>Minor</u> REVISION comments | | |
| <u>Optional/General</u> comments | | |